

Contents

1	The Problem of Punishment.....	1
1.1	The Paradox of Retribution.....	7
1.2	The Incoherence of Public Policy: A Muddle of Theories	9
1.3	The Rise of Abolitionism.....	13
1.4	The Strategy of This Book.....	15
1.5	The Importance of the Debate.....	16
2	Punishment as Crime Prevention	19
2.1	Does Punishment Prevent Crime?.....	22
2.2	Crime Prevention and the Utilitarian Moral Theory	24
2.3	The Critique of Consequentialism	25
2.4	Is It Ever Useful to Punish the Innocent?	29
2.5	Punishing the Guilty	32
2.6	What's Left of the Crime Prevention Theory?.....	33
2.7	The Intend/Foresee Distinction.....	35
2.8	The Crime-Prevention Theory and Double Effect.....	38
2.9	The DDE and Punishing the Innocent	41
2.10	Deterrence and Retribution	42
3	Can Retributive Punishment Be Justified?.....	47
3.1	Crypto-Utilitarian Theories of Retribution	48
3.1.1	The Deterrence-Based Theory of Retribution.....	49
3.1.2	Retribution and Satisfaction of Victims	50
3.2	Retribution as a Natural Instinct or Emotion	51
3.3	Retribution as a Requirement of Reason.....	54
3.3.1	Respect for the Offender	56
3.3.2	Right to Be Punished	57
3.3.3	Consent to Be Punished	59
3.3.4	Unfair Advantage.....	60
3.4	Retribution as Conceptual Requirement	62

3.5	The Expressive Theory of Retribution.....	64
3.5.1	Can the Expressive Theory Justify Punishment?	65
3.5.2	Why Hard Treatment?.....	66
3.6	Retribution as a Moral Primitive.....	67
4	The Mixed Theory of Punishment.....	73
4.1	The Idea of “Separate Questions”	75
4.2	The Conceptual Version of the Mixed Theory.....	76
4.3	Legal Formalism	78
4.4	The Separation of Powers Principle.....	80
4.5	The Rule-Utilitarian Theory	81
4.6	H.L.A. Hart’s Two-Level Theory.....	82
4.7	The “Practice Conception” Argument	87
4.8	Utilitarianism, Retribution, and the Two Levels.....	89
4.9	Conclusion	92
5	Retribution and Revenge.....	93
5.1	Six Supposed Distinctions Between Revenge and Retribution.....	95
5.2	Revenge Is Personal	95
5.3	Revenge Is Inherently Excessive.....	97
5.4	Revenge Is for Insults and Slights, Not Moral Wrongs	99
5.5	Revenge Is Based on Sadistic Pleasure.....	101
5.6	Revenge Is Based on the Principle of Collective Responsibility	102
5.7	Revenge Is Based upon Strict Liability.....	105
5.8	Conclusion: Revenge Versus Retribution.....	106
5.9	Is Revenge Morally Permissible?	109
5.10	Revenge, Retribution, and Honor.....	110
6	What Is the Purpose of Retribution?	113
6.1	The Intending Harm Requirement	115
6.2	Assessing the “Intending Harm Requirement”	117
6.3	The Purpose of Revenge	120
6.4	Punishment and Honor.....	123
6.5	Honor and Punishment.....	125
6.6	Intending Harm Versus Defending Honor	128
6.7	From Private Revenge to Societal Punishment	130
6.8	Retribution and Intentional Harm	137
6.9	Honor and Impartiality.....	143
6.10	The Expressive Theory Revisited	144
7	Making Sense of Honor	147
7.1	The Descriptive Claim and the Evolutionary Alternative	149
7.2	The Value of Honor.....	152
7.3	Is Honor Essentially External?.....	155

Contents	vii
7.4 The External Honor Thesis	156
7.5 Five Interpretations of the External Honor Thesis.....	160
7.6 Is Honor External?	164
8 Is Punishment Justified?.....	167
8.1 Intentional Versus Foreseen Harm	170
8.2 Punishment and Proportionality.....	171
8.3 Necessity and the Problem of Forgiveness	173
8.4 Is Restitution a “New Paradigm”?	178
8.5 The Role of the Victim.....	183
8.6 Victimless Crimes	185
8.7 Conclusion: Punishment as Defense of Honor	187
8.8 Is Punishment Justified?.....	190
Bibliography	193
Index.....	201