Contents

Abo	out the Editor	page xv
List	of Contributors	xvii
Pref	face	xix
Peri	nissions	xxiii
	Introduction Joel A. Nichols	1
1.	Multi-Tiered Marriage: Reconsidering the Boundaries of Civil Law and Religion Joel A. Nichols	11
2.	Pluralism and Decentralization in Marriage Regulation <i>Brian H. Bix</i>	60
3.	Marriage and the Law: Time for a Divorce? Stephen B. Presser	78
4.	Unofficial Family Law Ann Laquer Estin	92
5.	Covenant Marriage Laws: A Model for Compromise Katherine Shaw Spaht	120
6.	New York's Regulation of Jewish Marriage: Covenant, Contract, or Statute? Michael I. Broyde	138

viii Contents

7.	Political Liberalism, Islamic Family Law, and Family Law Pluralism Mohammad H. Fadel	164
8.	Multi-Tiered Marriages in South Africa Johan D. van der Vyver	200
9.	Ancient and Modern Boundary Crossings Between Personal Laws and Civil Law in Composite India Werner Menski	219
10.	The Perils of Privatized Marriage Robin Fretwell Wilson	253
11.	Canadian Conjugal Mosaic: From Multiculturalism to Multi- Conjugalism? Daniel Cere	284
12.	Marriage Pluralism in the United States: On Civil and Religious Jurisdiction and the Demands of Equal Citizenship Linda C. McClain	309
13.	Faith in Law? Diffusing Tensions Between Diversity and Equality Ayelet Shachar	341
14.	The Frontiers of Marital Pluralism: An Afterword John Witte Jr. and Joel A. Nichols	357
Inde	ex	379

Detail Contents

Ab	out the	Editor	page xv
Lis	t of Co	ntributors	xvii
Pre	face		xix
Per	mission	us	xxiii
		oduction A. Nichols	1
1.	Law	ti-Tiered Marriage: Reconsidering the Boundaries of Civil and Religion A. Nichols	11
	,	Introduction	11
	II.	A Short History of Marriage and Divorce Law Jurisdiction	15
	III.	Domestic Movement Toward Multi-Tiered Marriage A. Covenant Marriage Laws (Louisiana, Arkansas, and	19
		Arizona)	20
		B. New York's Get Statutes	23
	IV.	International Models	32
		A. India	33
		B. Kenya	44
		C. South Africa	49
		D. Canada	55
	V.	Conclusion	58
2.		alism and Decentralization in Marriage Regulation 1 H. Bix	60
	I.	Current and Growing Variety and Decentralization	61
	II.	Four Alternative Paths to Pluralism and Decentralization	64

		A. Delegation	64
		B. Individual Contracts	65
		C. Menus of Options	66
		D. Choice of Law	66
	III.	Interests in Uniformity	67
	IV.	The Nature of Marriage and the Role of the State	68
	V.	Limits?	71
		Government Interactions with Religion	73
		Constitutional Issues	75
	VIII.	Conclusion	76
3.	Marr	riage and the Law: Time for a Divorce?	78
		nen B. Presser	
	I.	A Roiling Political Issue	78
	II.	The Uneasy Relationship of the Civil Law to Marriage	81
		A. The English Common Law	81
		B. Colonial, Early Republican, and Nineteenth-Century	
		America	82
	III.	Where We Are Now	84
		A. The Right to Privacy	84
		B. The "Mystery Passage"	86
		C. "Landmarkism?"	87
	TX 7	D. The Future	88
	IV.	Conclusion	91
4.		fficial Family Law	92
		Laquer Estin	
	1.	Marriage Celebration: Convergence and Incorporation	98
		A. Marriage Celebrations	98
	TT	B. The Interaction of Religious and Civil Law	100
	II.	Divorce Law: Conflict and Accommodation	102
		A. Legislative Responses to Religious Diversity	105
	III.	B. Consent, Dissent, and Exit Marriage Norms: Prohibitions and Gatekeeping	109
	111.		112
		A. The Gatekeeping Function of Marriage Law B. Families Underground	112
	IV/	Conclusion	115
	1 V.	Conclusion	117
5.	Cove	enant Marriage Laws: A Model for Compromise	120
	Kath	erine Shaw Spaht	

	1.	What is Covenant Marriage?	120
		A. Premarital Counseling	122
		B. Declaration of Intent	123
		C. Restricted Grounds for Divorce	124
	II.	Why Covenant Marriage Statutes?	126
		A. Covenant Marriage Emphasizes Strengthening	
		Marriage, Not Merely Preventing Divorce	126
		B. Covenant Marriage Legislation Combines Components	
		Appealing to Political Conservatives and Liberals	128
		C. Covenant Marriage Invites Religion Back Into the	
		Public Square to Assist in Serving a Public Whose	
		Need is to Preserve Marriages	128
		D. Covenant Marriage Seeks to Persuade, Not Coerce, Citizens	
		to Elect a Stronger Commitment to Marriage	129
		E. Covenant Marriage Offers Traditional Communities a	
		Refuge from the Broader Postmodern Culture	129
		F. Covenant Marriage Offers the Promise of Surviving	
		Migratory Divorce	130
	III.	Marriage – and "Civil Marriage" and "Religious Marriage"	131
	IV.	Why Not Other Options?	134
	V.	Conclusion	136
6.	New	York's Regulation of Jewish Marriage: Covenant,	
		tract, or Statute?	138
		aael J. Broyde	
	I.	Introduction	138
	II.	Jewish Marriage Laws: Movement from Contract to	
		Covenant	140
	III.	Jewish Marriage Contracts and American Law	144
		A. The Enforceability of the Ketubah as a Contract	145
		B. Rabbinic Arbitration Agreements to Construct Jewish	
		Marriages	146
		C. The New York State Jewish Divorce Laws	148
	IV.	Jewish Marriage and Divorce in Practice in New York	154
		A. Prenuptial Agreements	156
		B. New York's Get Statutes	158
		C. Opting Out of the Secular Legal System	161
	V.	Other Models of Jewish and Secular Marriage Law	161
	VI.	Conclusion: The Problem of Obeying Two Legal	
		Systems	162

7 -	Polit	ical Liberalism, Islamic Family Law, and Family Law			
	Plura	alism	164		
	Moh	ammad H. Fadel			
	I.	Family Law Pluralism and Political Liberalism	167		
	II.	The Relationship of Islamic Law to Islamic Ethics	170		
	III.	The Scope of Islamic Family Law and its Relationship to			
		Islamic Ethics	173		
	IV.	Islam and Family Law Pluralism	175		
		A. Intra-Islamic Legal Pluralism and Islamic Family Law	175		
		B. The Contractual Nature of Islamic Family Law	178		
		C. Religious Regulation of the Family in Islam	180		
		D. Marriages of Non-Muslims and Islamic Family Law	184		
		E. Conclusion	185		
	V.	The Attractiveness of a Politically Liberal Family Law to			
		Muslims	185		
	VI.	Family Law Arbitration, Religious Law, and Public Policy:			
		The Case of New York	193		
	VII.	Conclusion	196		
8.	Multi-Tiered Marriages in South Africa				
	Johai	ı D. van der Vyver			
	I.	Basic Principles of the South African Law of Husband and			
		Wife	202		
	II.	Legalization of Customary African Marriages	203		
	III.	Applying Principles of Contract to Some Marriages Not			
		Recognized Under South African Law	209		
	IV.	Same-Sex Marriages	213		
	V.	Imposing Principles of Equity and Justice from the Top			
		Down	216		
9.	Anci	ent and Modern Boundary Crossings Between Personal Laws			
	and (Civil Law in Composite India	219		
	Werner Menski				
	I.	Introduction: The Realities of Pluralism	219		
	II.	Ancient Roots of Pluralism and Boundary Crossing	225		
	III.	Hindu Family Law within Composite India	231		
	IV.	The Tortuous Agenda of Legal Uniformity in Indian Law	233		
	V.	Postmodern Indian and Hindu Marriage Law	238		
	VI.	Post-Divorce Maintenance Laws, the Indian Constitution,			
		and Hindu Legal Concepts	244		
	VII.	Conclusion	249		

		Detail Contents	xiii
10.	The	Perils of Privatized Marriage	253
	Robin Fretwell Wilson		
	I.	Lived Experiences	257
		A. Faith-Healing Communities in the United States	258
		B. Family Law in Western Thrace	261
		C. Controversy Over Shari'a Courts in Great Britain	264
		D. Summary	268
	II.	Reasons for Caution	268
		A. Domestic Violence	269
		B. Child Physical Abuse and Corporal Punishment	271
		C. Child Sexual Abuse	273
		D. Summary	273
	III.	Tolerance of Family Violence	274
	IV.	Does Respect for Autonomy Trump Foreseeable	
		Inequities?	279
	V.	Evaluating Possible Regulatory Responses	281
	VI.	Conclusion	283

	D. Summary	268
II.	Reasons for Caution	268
	A. Domestic Violence	269
	B. Child Physical Abuse and Corporal Punishment	271
	C. Child Sexual Abuse	273
	D. Summary	273
III.	Tolerance of Family Violence	274
IV.	Does Respect for Autonomy Trump Foreseeable	
	Inequities?	279
V.	Evaluating Possible Regulatory Responses	281
VI.	Conclusion	283
Cana	adian Conjugal Mosaic: From Multiculturalism to Multi-	
	jugalism?	284
Dani	iel Cere	
I.	Constitutionality and Conjugality: The Civil and Religious	285
II.	From Multiculturalism to Multi-Tiered Conjugality?	293
III.	Conclusion	306
Marı	riage Pluralism in the United States: On Civil and Religious	
Juris	diction and the Demands of Equal Citizenship	309
Lind	a C. McClain	
I.	Introduction: The Call for More Pluralism and Shared	
	Jurisdiction in U.S. Family Law	309
II.	Whither the Demand for More Marriage Pluralism in the	
	United States?	312
	A. An Initial Question: Should Religious and Civil Family	
	Law Be Congruent?	312
	B. Tensions Between Civil and Religious Law: Gender Roles	
	and Gender Equality	318
III.	Pluralism in U.S. Family Law: Jurisdiction, Location, and	
	Citizenship	320
	A. Religious Marriage Contracts, Religious Arbitration, and	
	the Get Statutes	322
	B. Adjudication of Islamic Marriage Contracts: The Mahr	3 ² 3

11.

12.

٧.	Evaluating Possible Regulatory Responses	201
VI.	Conclusion	283
Conj	adian Conjugal Mosaic: From Multiculturalism to Multi- jugalism?	284
		- 0
	Constitutionality and Conjugality: The Civil and Religious	285
	From Multiculturalism to Multi-Tiered Conjugality?	293
111.	Conclusion	306
Marı	riage Pluralism in the United States: On Civil and Religious	
	diction and the Demands of Equal Citizenship	309
	a C. McClain)-/
I.		
	Jurisdiction in U.S. Family Law	309
II.	Whither the Demand for More Marriage Pluralism in the))
	United States?	312
	A. An Initial Question: Should Religious and Civil Family)
	Law Be Congruent?	312
	B. Tensions Between Civil and Religious Law: Gender Roles	512
	and Gender Equality	318
III.	Pluralism in U.S. Family Law: Jurisdiction, Location, and	310
111.	Citizenship	320
	A. Religious Marriage Contracts, Religious Arbitration, and	320
	the Get Statutes	322
	B. Adjudication of Islamic Marriage Contracts: The Mahr	323

		C. Resolving Conflicts Between Civil and Religious Divorce	
		Law: Two Contrasting Cases	326
	IV.	International Models?	329
		A. Assessing Multi-Tiered Marriage Through a Gender	
		Equality Lens	329
		B. Canada: Membership and Citizenship in Ontario's Faith-	
		Based Arbitration Controversy	331
	V.	Conclusion	339
13.	Faitl	n in Law? Diffusing Tensions Between Diversity and Equality	341
	Ayele	et Shachar	
	I.	Privatized Diversity	343
	II.	The Predicament Facing Vulnerable Members of Religious	
		Communities	346
	III.	Forging a New Path	349
	IV.	Regulated Interaction	351
	V.	Conclusion	356
14.	The	Frontiers of Marital Pluralism: An Afterword	357
	John	Witte Jr. and Joel A. Nichols	
	I.	Introduction	357
	II.	The Evolution of the (Western) Law of Marriage	361
	III.	Religion, Family, and the State	364
		A. The Case for Shari'a Councils	366
		B. The Case Against Shari'a Councils	367
		C. Lessons and Analogies	370
	IV.	First Amendment Considerations	373
Ind	ex		379