

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	<i>How This Book Came About and Why It Is Needed</i>	3
1.2	<i>Methodological Aspects</i>	7
1.2.1	<i>Political and Historical Background Analysis</i>	8
1.2.2	<i>Legal Analysis</i>	8
1.2.3	<i>Empirical Research</i>	9
1.2.4	<i>Pros and Cons of the Methodology</i>	16
1.3	<i>Outline</i>	17
	<i>Bibliography</i>	21
2	Protection of Human Rights Defenders	27
2.1	<i>Introduction</i>	27
2.2	<i>Who Are the Human Rights Defenders?</i>	28
2.3	<i>Why Protect Human Rights Defenders?</i>	33
2.4	<i>Examples of National Public Policy for Protecting Human Rights Defenders in Latin America</i>	38
2.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	49
	<i>Bibliography</i>	53
3	Brazil's Path Towards Human Rights	57
3.1	<i>Introduction</i>	57
3.2	<i>Politics of Human Rights Through Brazil's Re-Democratization</i>	58

3.2.1	<i>Military Dictatorship (1964–1985)</i>	59
3.2.1.1	<i>First Phase of the Spiral Model: Repression and Activation of Network</i>	59
3.2.1.2	<i>Second Phase of the Spiral Model: Denial</i>	61
3.2.1.3	<i>Third Phase of the Spiral Model: Tactical Concessions</i>	62
3.2.2	<i>Transition to Democracy (1985–1990)</i>	65
3.2.2.1	<i>Fourth Phase of the Spiral Model: Prescriptive Status</i>	66
3.2.3	<i>Constitutional Democracy (1990–2017)</i>	68
3.3	<i>Structural Problems and the Role Played by Human Rights Defenders</i>	76
3.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	80
	<i>Bibliography</i>	85
4	State and Civil Society's Responses to State and Non-State Actors' Violence Towards Human Rights Defenders	95
4.1	<i>Introduction</i>	95
4.2	<i>Violence Against Human Rights Defenders</i>	95
4.2.1	<i>State Violence Against HRDs</i>	97
4.2.2	<i>Non-State Violence Against HRDs</i>	99
4.3	<i>Responses to Violence Against Human Rights Defenders</i>	101
4.3.1	<i>Civil Society Responses to Violence Against HRDs</i>	101
4.3.2	<i>State Responses to Violence Against HRDs</i>	103
4.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	105
	<i>Bibliography</i>	107
5	The Path to the Creation of a Program for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders	111
5.1	<i>Introduction</i>	111
5.2	<i>Towards the Creation of the PPDDH: 1984–2003</i>	112
5.2.1	<i>Transnational Advocacy Networks (TANs) and Developments at UN and OAS HR Mechanisms</i>	112
5.2.2	<i>Latin American Consultations on HRDs</i>	114
5.2.3	<i>Brazilian Seminars on HRDs, the Permanent Committee for HRDs, and Further Repercussions</i>	115

5.3	<i>The Creation of the PPDDH: 2004</i>	122
5.3.1	<i>Further Transnational Political Engagements and the Three PPDDH Bills</i>	122
5.3.2	<i>The Launch of the PPDDH as a Political Response to International and Domestic Pressures</i>	123
5.4	<i>After the Creation of the PPDDH: 2005–Today</i>	128
5.4.1	<i>The PPDDH Second Launch as a Public Relations Act</i>	128
5.4.2	<i>Sister Dorothy Stang’s Assassination and the PPDDH’s Rushed Implementation in the States of Pará (PA), Espírito Santo (ES), and Pernambuco (PE)</i>	129
5.4.3	<i>Transnational Advocacy Networks (TANs) and Brazilian Committee of HRDs (CBDDH) Seek Specific Legislation for the PPDDH</i>	131
5.4.4	<i>Third PPDDH Bill, the Moving of the Manoel Mattos Case to Federal Jurisdiction, and New State Programs</i>	132
5.4.5	<i>More International (TANs) and Domestic (CBDDH) Pressures and Governments’ Lack of Political Will to Reform the PPDDH Successfully</i>	133
5.4.6	<i>Corruption Scandals, Operação Lava Jato (Car Wash Operation), the Impeachment of President Rousseff and Their Impacts on the Works of the PPDDH</i>	136
5.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	141
	<i>Bibliography</i>	148
6	The Legal Framework and Legal Functioning of the Program for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders	151
6.1	<i>Introduction</i>	151
6.2	<i>The Legal Framework for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders: Federal Level</i>	152
6.2.1	<i>The Place of the PPDDH-Federal in the Structures of Government</i>	154

6.2.2	<i>The State–Civil Society Model of Functioning</i>	156
6.3	<i>The Procedures Adopted by the PPDDH: Federal Level</i>	158
6.4	<i>Examples of How the PPDDH-Federal Handles Cases</i>	161
6.5	<i>The Legal Framework and Procedures of the State Programs: Two Examples</i>	164
6.5.1	<i>The Program for the Protection of HRDs of the State of Espírito Santo (PPDDH-ES)</i>	166
6.5.2	<i>The Program for the Protection of HRDs of the State of Pará (PPDDH-PA)</i>	168
6.6	<i>The State–Civil Society vs. State–State Models of Functioning: A Brief Comparison</i>	171
6.7	<i>Summary of Results from a Statistical Analysis of the Program’s Functioning</i>	174
6.8	<i>Conclusion</i>	177
	<i>Bibliography</i>	180
7	The Effects in Practice of the Program for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders	181
7.1	<i>Introduction</i>	181
7.2	<i>Responses to the Interview Question Do You Think the PPDDH Is Important?</i>	182
7.2.1	<i>The PPDDH Protects the Lives of HRDs</i>	182
7.2.2	<i>The PPDDH Is a Place from Which HRDs Can Get Help</i>	185
7.2.3	<i>The PPDDH Helps Redress the Balance Between Vulnerable and Powerful Groups</i>	186
7.2.4	<i>The PPDDH Is an Articulador Político (Political Articulator or Engager)</i>	187
7.2.5	<i>Dissident Voices</i>	188
7.2.6	<i>Summary of Responses from All Three Groups</i>	189
7.3	<i>Responses to the Interview Question Do You Think the PPDDH Does What It Promises, That Is, Do You Think It Really Protects Those People Designated as Human Rights Defenders?</i>	190
7.3.1	<i>Reasons for Saying that the PPDDH Does Protect HRDs</i>	191
7.3.1.1	<i>The PPDDH Protects the Lives of HRDs</i>	191
7.3.1.2	<i>The PPDDH Is a Place Where HRDs Can Get Help</i>	192

7.3.2	Reasons for Saying That the PPDDH <i>Protects</i> HRDs <i>Only Partially or Not at All</i>	193
7.3.2.1	<i>The Brazilian State Does Not Provide the PPDDH with the Resources It Needs to Function Effectively</i>	193
7.3.2.2	<i>The PPDDH Depends on Other Actors to Provide Protection for HRDs</i>	195
7.3.3	<i>Summary of Responses from All Three Groups</i>	197
7.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	198
	<i>Bibliography</i>	199
8	The Broader Effects of the Program for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders	201
8.1	<i>Introduction</i>	201
8.2	<i>Who Else, Other Than the People Under Its Protection, Are Benefiting from the PPDDH?</i>	202
8.2.1	<i>Direct Beneficiaries of the PPDDH</i>	202
8.2.2	<i>Indirect Beneficiaries of the PPDDH</i>	204
8.2.3	<i>Summary of Beneficiaries of the PPDDH</i>	206
8.3	<i>Responses to the Interview Question In Which Way(s) Could the PPDDH Contribute to the Fight for Human Rights?</i>	208
8.3.1	<i>By Protecting the Physical Integrity of HRDs</i>	208
8.3.2	<i>By Guaranteeing That HRDs Can Continue Their Fight for HR</i>	209
8.3.3	<i>By Providing Support and Assistance to HRDs</i>	211
8.3.4	<i>By Training HRDs</i>	214
8.3.5	<i>By Empowering HRDs in Their Fight for HR</i>	216
8.3.6	<i>By Engaging with Other State Bodies</i>	217
8.3.7	<i>Dissident Voices</i>	218
8.3.8	<i>Summary of Responses</i>	220
8.4	<i>Analysis of the Broader Effects of the PPDDH</i>	221
8.4.1	<i>Bolstering HR Activism</i>	221
8.4.2	<i>Empowering OCS</i>	222
8.4.3	<i>Redressing the Balance of Power between Dominant and Dominated</i>	224
8.4.4	<i>Changing the Workings of the Brazilian State</i>	226
8.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	227
	<i>Bibliography</i>	230

9	What Is Preventing the Program for the Protection of Human Rights Defenders from Fulfilling Its Potential, and What Can Be Done?	231
9.1	<i>Introduction</i>	231
9.2	<i>Shortcomings of the PPDDH</i>	232
9.2.1	<i>Limited Budget and a Lack of Resources</i>	232
9.2.2	<i>The PPDDH's Dependence on Other Actors to Provide the Protection for HRDs</i>	233
9.2.3	<i>Lack of a Dedicated Legislative Framework</i>	234
9.2.4	<i>Lack of Political Will from Brazil's Federal and State Governments</i>	236
9.3	<i>Building the Political Will to Reform the PPDDH</i>	237
9.3.1	<i>Ongoing Political Initiatives for Reforming the PPDDH</i>	238
9.3.1.1	<i>Political Initiatives for Reforming the PPDDH at State Level</i>	238
9.3.1.2	<i>A Political Initiative for Reforming the PPDDH at OCS Level</i>	242
9.3.2	<i>Interviewees' Ideas for Reforming the PPDDH</i>	242
9.4	<i>Conclusion</i>	244
	<i>Bibliography</i>	248
10	Conclusion	249
10.1	<i>Summary of Key Findings</i>	249
10.1.1	<i>Why Was the PPDDH Really Created in 2004? How Did Its Creation Reflect Developments in HR Since the 1970s?</i>	252
10.1.2	<i>How Has the PPDDH Functioned Since Its Creation in 2004? Is the PPDDH Really Fulfilling Its Stated Aims by Protecting People Who Have Been Designated as HRDs?</i>	253
10.1.3	<i>Who Else Does the Existence of the PPDDH Benefit?</i>	254
10.1.4	<i>What Kind of Change—If Any—Has the Creation of the PPDDH Produced in the Broader HR Situation?</i>	255
10.1.5	<i>To the Extent That the PPDDH Has the Potential to Affect HR Change, i.e.,</i>	

	<i>To Help Tackle Social Authoritarianism, What Is Keeping the PPDDH from Fulfilling Its Potential and What Can Be Done to Remove These Obstacles?</i>	257
	<i>10.1.5.1 How Can the Legal Framework for the PPDDH be Developed Further?</i>	258
10.2	<i>Recommendations for Reforming the PPDDH</i>	259
	<i>10.2.1 Evaluation of Interviewees' Answers for Reforming the PPDDH</i>	259
	<i>10.2.1.1 The State Should Take Over the Full Management and Execution of the PPDDH</i>	259
	<i>10.2.1.2 The PPDDH Should Prevent Occasional Militants from Misusing Their Status as HRDs under the Protection of the PPDDH and Direct Its Protection to HRDs at Grassroots Level</i>	261
	<i>10.2.1.3 Better Protocols for the PPDDH Regarding Inclusion and Exclusion of HRDs</i>	262
	<i>10.2.1.4 Passing of the Third PPDDH Bill n° 4.575/2009</i>	263
	<i>10.2.1.5 The PPDDH Should Advertise Its Own Existence to HRDs Better</i>	264
10.2.2	<i>Own Recommendations for Reforming the PPDDH</i>	264
	<i>10.2.2.1 Creation, Implementation, Resuming, and Resourcing of State Programs for the Protection of HRDs in All 21 Brazilian States Where There Is None</i>	264
	<i>10.2.2.2 The PPDDH Should Be under the Administrative Authority of the National Human Rights Council (CNDH)</i>	265
10.2.3	<i>The Need to Strengthen the Political Will to Reform the PPDDH</i>	266

xxx CONTENTS

<i>10.3 Opportunities for Further Research</i>	267
<i>Bibliography</i>	269

Bibliography	271
---------------------	-----

Index	295
--------------	-----