

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Discriminatory Violence as a Global Phenomenon	1
1.2	The Need for a More Significant Role for the ECtHR in Addressing and Combating the Phenomenon of Discriminatory Violence	6
1.3	Scope and Structure of This Book	15
1.4	Some Final Words on Methodology	21
2	Contextualising Discriminatory Violence within the Council of Europe	23
2.1	Introduction	23
2.2	The Substantive Legal Framework: Anti-Discrimination Law in the Council of Europe	24
2.3	General Features of Article 14 ECHR and Their Impact on Complaints of Discriminatory Violence	31
2.4	Important Taxonomies to Categorise Discrimination Complaints	39
2.4.1	<i>Formal and Substantive Equality</i>	40
2.4.2	<i>Direct and Indirect Discrimination</i>	46
2.5	Conclusion	53
3	Ordering Discriminatory Violence: Three Types of Complaints	55
3.1	Introduction	55
3.2	The Negative Duty of State Officials to Refrain from Inflicting Discriminatory Violence	58
3.3	The Positive Duty of State Officials to Effectively Investigate Discriminatory Violence and to Identify and Punish Those Responsible	66
3.4	The Positive Duty of State Officials to Take Preventive Measures against Discriminatory Violence	75
3.5	The Remaining Cases of Discriminatory Violence: Complaints Connected to Provisions Other than Article 2 or Article 3 ECHR	82
3.6	Conclusion	88
4	The Collection of Facts and the Actors Involved in Fact-Finding at the ECtHR	91
4.1	Introduction	91
4.2	The Legal Framework for the Examination of a Case by the ECtHR	92

- 4.3 How Applicants and Respondent States are Engaged in Fact-Finding during the Procedure before the ECtHR 96
 - 4.3.1 *Presenting an Application to the Court* 96
 - 4.3.2 *The Parties' Obligation to Cooperate with the Court* 102
- 4.4 Fact-Finding Missions Conducted by the ECtHR 107
- 4.5 Contributions to Fact-Finding by External Actors 113
- 4.6 Conclusion 122

- 5 The Standard of Proof in Cases of Discriminatory Violence 125**
 - 5.1 Introduction 125
 - 5.2 Some General Observations on the Notion of 'Standard of Proof' 126
 - 5.3 Standards of Proof in ECtHR Case Law 130
 - 5.4 'Beyond Reasonable Doubt' in ECtHR Case Law 140
 - 5.4.1 *The ECtHR Definition of 'Beyond Reasonable Doubt' and the Origins of This Standard of Proof* 142
 - 5.4.2 *Testing the 'Beyond Reasonable Doubt' Standard in Cases of Discriminatory Violence* 146
 - 5.5 Conclusion 155

- 6 The Distribution of the Burden of Proof in Cases of Discriminatory Violence 158**
 - 6.1 Introduction 158
 - 6.2 Some General Observations on the 'Burden of Proof' 161
 - 6.3 Presumptions and Inferences 170
 - 6.4 The Influence of Presumptions and Inferences on the Distribution of the Burden of Proof in Violence Cases 174
 - 6.4.1 *Cases in which Individuals were Injured, Died or Disappeared While in the Hands of State Agents* 174
 - 6.4.2 *Presumptions and Inferences in Cases in which Evidence Discloses an Administrative Practice* 192
 - 6.4.3 *Interim Conclusion* 197
 - 6.5 The Distribution of the Burden of Proof in Cases in which a Discriminatory Nature of Violence is Alleged 197
 - 6.5.1 *The Circumstances under which the Burden of Proof May Shift* 201
 - 6.5.2 *Exploring New Criteria to Shift the Burden of Proof in Cases of Discriminatory Violence* 212
 - 6.6 Conclusion 225

7	Evidentiary Material Used to Prove Discriminatory Violence at the ECtHR	229
7.1	Introduction	229
7.2	Admissibility of Evidence in ECtHR Proceedings	231
7.3	Factual Elements from the Domestic Case File Pointing to Discriminatory Violence	233
7.3.1	<i>Confessions</i>	234
7.3.2	<i>Instructions</i>	235
7.3.3	<i>Discriminatory Remarks</i>	235
7.3.4	<i>Extremist Groups</i>	242
7.3.5	<i>The Remaining Factual Elements</i>	243
7.3.6	<i>Interim Conclusion</i>	245
7.4	Statistics	248
7.4.1	<i>General Views on Statistics as Evidence</i>	250
7.4.2	<i>The ECtHR Approach: Statistics Gaining Ground as Evidence in Cases of Indirect Discrimination</i>	252
7.4.3	<i>The Use of Statistics in Cases of Discriminatory Violence</i>	256
7.5	Reports Issued by Intergovernmental Organisations and NGOs	263
7.6	Conclusion	268
8	Conclusion	271
8.1	Introduction	271
8.2	'Discrimination' and 'Discriminatory Violence' in ECtHR Case Law: A Call for a More Substantive Conception of Equality in Cases Concerning Discriminatory Violence	273
8.3	Most Notable Means of Gathering Facts and Evidence in the Context of Complaints of Discriminatory Violence at the Court	277
8.4	The Adequacy of the Evidentiary Framework in Cases of Discriminatory Violence	278
8.4.1	<i>Standard of Proof</i>	279
8.4.2	<i>Burden of Proof</i>	281
8.4.3	<i>Evidentiary Material</i>	284
8.4.4	<i>Synopsis: Evaluating the Evidentiary Framework in ECtHR Cases of Discriminatory Violence</i>	286
8.5	Epilogue and Outlook: The ECtHR as the Guardian of the Rights of Disadvantaged Groups	287
	Bibliography	291
	Index	316